LANGUAGE, CULTURAL IDENTITY, AND RELIGIOUS INCLUSION

By A.N. Akwanya

Abstract

Identity for human beings has much to do with belongingness to a group with shared beliefs and customs and a common language, which means that the sense of who one is can change in significant ways by reason of changes in these modes of non-material production. One ordinarily belongs to a group by birth and grows up with their language and total culture, with these now working with this individual as second nature. At this level, inclusion in a group is simultaneously exclusion from other groups, whereas secularism with its cosmopolitan outlook makes possible membership in several groups at the same time. But cosmopolitanism is no less a loss of identity than other global systems like world religions which pressure or persuade individuals either voluntarily to forsake identities based on where one is born and brought up and affiliate to global systems or to accept an imposed identity and regrouping. Given these expanding systems, the history of human civilization has also been marked by struggle for space and violent conflict where movements with similar aims meet. The key elements of identity - religion, culture, and language are often the most problematic to come to terms with. Sharing as part of their self-understanding the idea that they alone embody the truth to be believed in, the spread of world religions is at the same time the displacement or even destruction of the tribal religions in their path. But substituting the total culture, which is equivalent to creating entirely new entities out of the old, or 'identity theft' as this has also been called, tended to work against the overall interests of these world religions. As a result, some have made compromises, taking in elements of the old culture. But the practice remains quite divided when it comes to the languages of the peoples being incorporated.

Introduction

Humanity may be seen to consist of a patchwork of linguistically and ethnically distinctive groups, some large and occupying a comparatively large area of the habitable portion of the earth, some very small and restricted to a very small portion. There are a few, however, who move around and do not exercise permanent occupation of a specific patch. Most of the other families of humankind are associated with specific patches, and most individuals belong to one or another of these groups; and no one is neither here nor there, except perhaps by choice. At this level, inclusion means to be excluded from all but one. But inclusion can become a project; for example, by creating a system and bringing other human beings in as sharers or by exporting that value system and persuading or in some other way getting other human beings to adapt to its demands. The project of inclusion is probably first encountered as a historical movement in the rise of empires in the ancient world, where in the interest of economic advantage, armies were put in the field and political cultures instituted.

Not so long ago, Africa was divided up into spheres of influence by the great European powers, and the local economies reorganized to provide raw materials to supply the

factories of the imperial heartland and a market for the finished products of these factories. The nationalist movements that led to the political independence of the formerly colonized peoples did not disrupt the system of production instituted by the colonial powers or challenge and redirect the economic interest which was the driver of inclusion into the colonial system. Inclusion in the colonial format is still taking place, but is disguised in various terminologies and metaphors, like increasing/maintaining one's market share, globalization and the global market, consumerism and consumer culture. In all these, inclusion remains the project, and economic interest the driver; in all these, those who are economically powerful use various political and quasi-military strategies to protect and build on their initial advantage - which means that those who are being included are kept permanently in a condition of disadvantage.

There are also movements of inclusion which are need-driven. An early example is the spread of Greek language and culture throughout the Eastern Mediterranean from the fourth and fifth centuries BC. The first wave was undoubtedly in association with empirebuilding by Alexander the Great and his successors. But having opened the way to the spread of the high culture of learning and artistic production associated with classical Greece, many of the privileged began to seek to acquire the language for purposes of prestige or in order to have access to the highly regarded Greek culture and learning. A common Greek (Koine) also developed and was in use in the seaports and commercial centres as a kind of lingua franca. Today English exercises a similar attraction in many parts of the world; and there are people who are adding the language out of a felt need to belong and participate in the discourse of an international community of professionals of one kind or another. Hence Barbara Strang identifies as C-speakers of English, 'those throughout the world for whom English is a foreign language, its study required, often as the first foreign language, as part of the country's educational curriculum, though the language has no official, or an even traditional, standing in that country' (1970:18). A-speakers and B-speakers, on the other hand, are respectively those whom English serves as their first language and those, like the formerly colonized peoples, whose countries historically came into the sphere of influence of an English-speaking country, for whom English has a key role in education, has an official or semi-official status, and is really what is meant when people are said to be literate or illiterate. The experience of Africa over more than a century of experience under modern states shows that identity rooted in culture remains a powerful force exercising consciousness. In this paper, I shall explore some of the ways in which the globalizing forces of inclusion and those of cultural identity interact and play out.

Language and Religion

Language and religion are of fundamental importance in cultural studies and human geography. Among indigenous peoples, religion is 'natural' not 'founded' (Peachey 2009); it is clan-based and may be coextensive with language distribution, which means that those who share the language have access to the religious life of the community. In this case, the cultural identity of the specific human community is connected to its language and religion as well as all the other modes of adjustment to the patch of the earth they occupy which may be evolving or have been perfected over time and are being handed on from generation to generation. Thus it is expected that the geography of distribution of indigenous languages will not fundamentally differ from the geography of distribution of indigenous religions. The individual partly derives his identity from this group and partly constructs it, but always within the framework of that group's self-identity and its environment. As Habermas has shown, the ego by adapting 'itself to its external conditions through learning processes, is initiated into the communication system of a social life-world by means of self-formative processes, and constructs an identity in the conflict between instinctual aims and social constraints' (313).

A common feature of these indigenous religions is that they are inward-looking and grow mainly by natural increase. They do not generally seek to convert other peoples to their vision and way of life; hence in some of the African Traditional religions, possession of the local language is not always enough qualification for inclusion.

Being born a member of the group is much more important; and this is one reason why these religions are sometimes classified as tribal religions. These are strictly ethnic formations where inclusion is 'founded on an imagined blood relation or on cultural identity, of people who share a belief in a common origin, identify one another as "members" of the same community, and thereby set themselves apart from their environment' (Habermas 1998). Tribal religions thus set up bonds of solidarity more intimate than those afforded by language and emphasize loyalty to the ancestors or the putative common ancestor. Some postcolonial advocacy has focused on this very issue: that the indigenous peoples have a right to their language, religion, and way of life, and that seeking to convert them to other religions and ways of life amounts to an injustice. For instance, according to Okere,

Perhaps there has been no more effective agent in the de-stabilization of the old culture than Christianity itself whose frontal and total war on the traditional religion has led to the collapse of a well-wrought and integrated system of belief that formed the support of the culture. For if Christianity's monotheism and system of belief was alone true, as missionaries kept insisting – a claim which seemed to be supported by the impressive wizardry of power, science, technology and material wealth associated with the new religion – then the familiar gods of the traditional pantheon were forever discredited. They were even demonized as evil agents of the Devil, a monster till then yet unknown (2009. Web).

According to Okere then, the tools in the service of the Christian missionaries were not religious ones only. Even science and technology and material wealth were involved – aspects of material culture which mainstream Christianity would hardly acknowledge as part of its system. Advocacy in Nze ('The Influence of Christian Values on Culture') is similarly in terms of complicity of Christianity allegedly with Western material culture in an all-out war against traditional religion. As we shall see, the Christian Church views the history of its relationship to the indigenous cultures and religions in terms of dialogue and inculturation. But if 'frontal and total war' is the perception among the target community, 'inculturaton' may boil down to a mode of disguised violence or else it may be a peaceable policy articulated at the top but disregarded in practice. There remains the possibility, though, that these readings derive more from what Habermas has called, 'the concentrated ressentiment of ... generations of ... obscurantists' than from evidence. At all events, post-colonial advocacy has served to highlight the fact that the expansion of the major world religions is mostly at

the expense of the cultural identity of the traditional peoples. It raises at the academic level a question similar to that raised by climate change. Various life forms are under pressure as climate changes and are in some cases under threat of extinction. And this is undoubtedly a serious problem. Similarly, the question of cultural diversity is raised in the face of expanding world religious systems and with it the survival of various indigenous ways, for as McLean has written, 'cultures are rooted in the basic religious commitments of their people' (2009, 'Preface'). Mass conversions of indigenous peoples are bound to affect the world's cultural map. On the other hand, it is far from clear whether the indigenous peoples would be better served in an unchanged traditional way of life or by inclusion, enabling full and active participation in the modern world. To what extent is such participation possible without internal transformation, as by education? For Western education has become the chief means of spread of a secularist and cosmopolitan culture – which is why radical Islamist groups like Nigeria's Boko Haram are so implacably hostile to it. Farr who discusses the problems of spread of world religions in terms of conversion efforts within the religious bodies themselves, is of the view that such activities 'can contribute to stable, liberal and just governance' as long as they are 'understood as peaceful persuasion, respectful of human dignity, culture and tradition' (2010). But the question is whether conversion can be done without infringing upon human dignity, culture and tradition, a dilemma which is reflected in the very title of his paper, 'Proselytism and Religious Identity Theft'.

Proselytism is itself a controverted concept (Rodano 2001; Walsh 2012). For instance, the Christian churches think of their missionary activities as evangelization, and emphatically not proselytism. Whatever the case, the extent of impact on cultural diversity is obviously grave if both the religion and the language of the group are replaced by reason of exposure to a world religion, because in that case the people are assimilated and little or no trace of their former identity is left. The Berbers of North Africa present a case of an ethnic identity seriously compromised by virtue of replacement of the indigenous religions by Islam and adoption of Arabic as their language. The following comment in the Encyclo-

pedia Britannica is fairly graphic:

The Berbers strenuously resisted the Arab invasion of the 7th century AD, but they were eventually converted to Islam. Many Berbers also adopted Arabic as their language and were thus assimilated into the Arab community.

Once widespread throughout northern Africa, though with a very weak social organization, the 'Berbers are now usually identified on a linguistic rather than an ethnic basis' (Encarta). Very little of their distinctive ways of life has survived over the centuries. But the language has held out in the face of the assimilative pressure of Arabic on the one hand, and on the other denial of right of use for official or educational purposes by the Moroccan state, where the Berbers constitute as much as 40% of the population (Encarta). The resistance of this group to assimilation and complete reduction to the majority ethno-religious group is expressed in the demand that their children be taught in their own tongue. And they are left with a stark choice where the demand is not granted: either to accept Arabic culture and participate in national life or to remain in the marginal desert areas in the traditional occupations of herding sheep and goats and camels. These stark alternatives comprise their

conditions of life for the Berbers in Morocco and elsewhere in northern Africa like Algeria, Libya, and Tunisia, where they are more thinly distributed.

The World Religions and Language Spread

In *The Varieties of Religious Experience*, William James distinguishes in religious phenomena the experience of the individual 'for whom religion exists not as a dull habit, but as an acute fever rather' and the 'ordinary religious believer, who follows the conventional observances of his country, whether it be Buddhist, Christian, or [Muslim]. His religion has been made for him by others, communicated to him by tradition, determined to fixed forms by imitation, and retained by habit' (15). James's interest in this *magnum opus* is with religion as individual feeling as opposed to religion as a codified system of belief and practice, which incorporates individuals as members of a community with a common vision and meaning of life and a common standard of morality guaranteed and handed down by a sacred person hallowed by the group. In this paper, the use of the concept *religion* pertains to the system which incorporates individuals as members.

Yet there is a connection. Religion may be for James an experience purely private to the individual, but the great examples of this kind of experience which he identifies are the religious 'geniuses' who found religions or movements within religious bodies. From the moment that other people are attracted to the genius either because of his way of life or because they are persuaded by what he says, the essential elements of *organized* religion are beginning to manifest. Some of the writings called religious scriptures are the work of these leaders. In other words, though the experience may be private to the individual soul, it enters the public domain and becomes communicable if it attains representation by linguistic signs. Language in fact has an irreplaceable role to play in the codification, organization, and transmission of religion; and it provides special facilitation for the spread of religion particularly in its written form. The written form fosters the sense of authenticity and authoritativeness, as well as sameness, as expansive religions usually have complex belief systems which have to be protected from alteration in the diffusion.

Unlike the tribal and traditional indigenous religions which tend to be circumscribed in a specific geographical space, the world religions may have a core area, but their vision is global and they are committed to including in their fold, if possible, all the world's inhabitants. Christianity was in fact the first religious organization to seek to create one single community out of the world's many peoples purely on the basis of persuasion. St Augustine calls this community the 'city of God in its pilgrim state' (672). From the outset, therefore, it had a missionary component, comprising individuals and groups serving as agents of spread of its message and vision of life to peoples wherever they may be. Before very long, however, there were several of these world religious movements with the same identical aim, namely to incorporate the greatest possible percentage of humankind. For this very reason they tend to be mutually antagonistic. In the past, the places where their different missionary or proselytizing activities met often became zones of conflict. Sometimes there were major wars fought in the interest of one religious protagonist against another, despite that each and every world religion proclaims peace as a core value. Such religious wars were fought in Europe throughout the sixteenth century between Catholics and various Protestant

movements and powers in some cases with great savagery (Macaulay 2006 (IV):315). Similarly, faith issues are often cited in discussion of the clashes that occur from time to time in places like Jos and Kaduna in Northern Nigeria, and the bombings and targeted assaults on civilians in places of worship, markets, educational institutions, and so on which have occurred in recent times in other parts of that region. There may be an element of struggle for space between Islam and Christianity involved. The modern state, however, claims the exclusive right to hold and to defend a territory within which it alone exercises jurisdiction. For this reason all such violent struggles for space are taken up as grave matters of law and order and a challenge to the existence of the state itself.

Tribal religions, as we have seen, are premised on the sense of the group as belonging to one family with a common ancestor. They have no scriptures and depend on oral transmission within a specific cultural space. World religions, on the other hand, are committed to organizing all their adherents, no matter what their backgrounds, into a single community on the basis of one common faith. This is a major reason why world religions have to take a stand with respect to language; for language is a basic factor of bonding and solidarity among human beings. For the tribe, a shared tongue, down to the dialect, together with birth in the self same geographical space claimed by a group as their heritage

their oral traditions belief in ancestors as part of a family with other siblings, who are themselves founders of town-communities. Few of these oral traditions, however, appear to have been formally investigated and evaluated by ethnologists, but by reason of 'the total culture', namely the shared customs, cultic, social, and linguistic practices, the town groupings come close to what is designated a tribe in anthropology (Lévi-Strauss 1963: 6). Within this group musical performances circulate and diffuse freely; masquerade types and performances may be learned and adapted, and intermarriage may take place. Cultic actions are generally similar throughout the tribe, but they are strictly localised within the community and participation by any others, even within the tribe, is only as spectators because of the stress on rootedness in a divinity.

Beyond the tribe, language does become a barrier. But organized religion, committed to a global reach, does not recognize any obstacle, human, cultural, or geographical, as insurmountable. The linguistic obstacle has therefore been overcome in one of two ways: either by replacing the local language with the preferred language of the religious movement or by insertion of the teachings, values, and practices of the in-coming religion into the local language. With respect to the peoples affected by the religious movements taking the first path of spread, these religions and the languages with which they are diffused have sometimes been characterized as *invading* religions/languages (Lang, Myth, Ritual, and Religion). To serve as a replacive, the invading language having been reinforced by the teachings, beliefs, and practices propagated by that religion, becomes part of the shared values characterizing that religion.

Generally speaking, religions that have scriptures, which is normally the case with world religions, have a special relation to the language in which those scriptures were originally composed. For example, Hebrew, the language in which the Old Testament books were

composed has continued to be used in Judaism as the language of ritual, even though it ceased being a 'living language' from about the second century BC (see "Hebrew Language." Microsoft® Encarta® 2009). Latin played a similar role in the liturgy of the Catholic Church for many centuries until the reforms of Vatican Council II in the middle of the twentieth century; and the reasons were purely historical. Arabic, equally, holds a special dignity in Islam because of the Koran written in that language. It remains the religious language of Islam even in places where the local languages were preserved after conversion to Islam. The spread of Islam in Africa, for example in the Maghreb, is associated with intense and sustained Arabization. According to Benmamoun,

The Arabs brought with them two varieties of Arabic. The first was Classical Arabic, the language of Islam. Indeed, Islam gives a privileged position to Arabic. It is the language of the Qu'ran and prayers are conducted only in Arabic. Thus, it is not surprising that those who want to maintain the position of Arabic in spheres other than religion rely on verses of the Qu'ran and sayings attributed to the Prophet that explicitly proclaim the unique position of Classical Arabic (2001:98).

The second variety of Arabic which was introduced everywhere that Islam went, especially in Africa, was colloquial Arabic, which is used in trade and other interpersonal exchanges. This, no doubt, fostered the creation of an atmosphere favourable to the adding of the Classical form needed for participation in the most basic aspects of the religious life of the community. For example, prayer to be performed five times daily is one of the Five Pillars of Islam and had to be done in Classical Arabic. Clearly then, no one could really be a Muslim without a basic knowledge of Arabic. But it had an additional reinforcement, namely education. Benmamoun explains:

Similar to the situation in the educational institutions in the East, in the main learning centers in the Maghreb, particularly the Alqarawiyyin mosque in Morocco and the Al-Zaytuna mosque in Tunisia, Classical Arabic was the only language of teaching and scholarship. (99)

Arabic is not heavily used for education in places where the local language has a script and is sufficiently developed for literary and scientific activities. The development of script for African languages is a fairly recent event and came well after the peak of Islamic expansion in Africa; and so education throughout the areas being penetrated by Islam was through Classical Arabic. We can say that with Islam, there is a classic situation of religious inclusion achieved and facilitated by addition of a specific language. Judaism seems to go much farther as it not only inculcates Hebrew in the proselytes for ritual purposes, but also aims to assimilate them into the Jewish Law and way of life (Robertson 1954; Lierman 2004:185).

Hinduism, another world religion we are considering, brings along Sanskrit, the original language of the Vedas and other writings sacred to the religion. The language has not been in popular usage for thousands of years but has survived, thanks mainly to the Hindu religion. According to Mario Pei,

Since roughly the beginning of the Christian era, Sanskrit has been more or less artificially maintained as the literary language of the priestly, learned, and cultivated castes of India, and it retains this position in the 20th century (Encarta).

The religions that transmit a specific language sometimes do so in order to ensure strict adherence to the tradition; for as Balkin has noted, Religions ... usually include many accretions over time. These accretions benefit from the general acceptance of religious belief and powerful memes for faith. Believers follow the tenets and practices of a general religious tradition together rather than investigating each one separately (1998:75).

Accretions within Catholic Christianity was one of the issues cited by the Protestant Reformers to counter which Bible reading became a characterizing requirement for Protestant Christianity. This Bible was not in the original languages but a translation that came to be treated as the scriptures, and surrounded with every air of inviolable sanctity. Such is the King James Version of 1611/1769, for example, which remains the Protestant English Bible despite that its language would be considered rather archaic compared to contemporary English. This Classic has given Anglican Protestantism a 'confessional' language (see Clingerman 2009), which is being spread and handed on through individual daily Bible reading and communal worship.

Despite this close relationship to the sacred text, accretions still do occur in religious practice. For example, in some Protestant Churches women ordination as priests has become an accepted fact, while others are unsure that such a feature is provided for in the Bible. And among those who accept women ordination as priests, the majority seem not to be willing as yet to accept women ordination as bishops. Similar accretions are observed in Islam. Hence we are told in Taqiuddin an-Nabhani's *The Social System in Islam*,

So a group or rather groups were formed which called for the obligation of protecting Muslim women and safeguarding the virtues in society. However, they did this without understanding the systems of Islam nor were the Shari'ah rules clear to them. They accepted interest (Maslaha), as perceived by the mind, as a basis for study and as a criterion for judging ideas and matters. They also called for the preservation of customs and traditions. They called people to hold on to morals, without comprehending that the basis is the Islamic 'Aqeedah and that the criterion is the Shari'ah rules. Blind fanaticism concerning the Hijab of women reached the point where they advocated restrictions over women, not giving them permission to leave their house, or to undertake the fulfilment of their needs, or pursue matters themselves (12).

The other path of overcoming the language barrier, which is by inserting the teachings, values, and religious practices in the local language, is the way of Christianity. Its scriptures are in Hebrew and Greek. These languages remain important to Christianity, but knowledge of them is required only of experts who may give authoritative interpretations of

the texts and provide the translations which are the ordinary means through which the vast majority of Christians access their sacred texts. The Christian attitude is that the truth of the faith is a category quite different from the language of its expression. It is an insight which is part and parcel of the launching of the missionary activity of the Christian Church to all nations through the gift of the Holy Spirit with the sound of a mighty wind in Acts chapter 2, where we read:

Now there were devout men living in Jerusalem from every nation under heaven, and at this sound they all assembled, and each one was bewildered to hear these men speaking his own language. They were amazed and astonished. 'Surely,' they said, 'all these men speaking are Galileans? How does it happen that each of us hears them in his own native language? Parthians, Medes and Elamites; people from Mesopotamia, Judaea and Cappadocia, Pontus and Asia, Phrygia and Pamphylia, Egypt and the parts of Libya round Cyrene; residents of Rome – Jews and proselytes alike – Cretans and Arabs, we hear them preaching in our own language about the marvels of God.' Everyone was amazed and perplexed; they asked one another what it all meant.

By reason of this tradition, the Christian Church makes every effort to speak the language of the peoples to whom they wish to address the gospel. That message was to be given in writing for one reason or another in the decades following the above event; and it was done in Koine Greek, the lingua franca of the Eastern Mediterranean where the message first began to be spread. These were the writings that were eventually gathered together as the New Testament. In some of them a word or two of Aramaic are encountered – that is the language spoken by Jesus. But it was at best a distant memory as far as the bulk of the New Testament is concerned.

The Christian Church's relation to its target communities is broadened and deepened in what is known as 'inculturation.' This entails that there is a dialogue between the good news and the local culture instead of outright inclusion. As John Paul II writes,

Through inculturation the Church makes the Gospel incarnate in different cultures and at the same time introduces peoples, together with their cultures, into her own community. She transmits to them her own values, at the same time taking the good elements that already exist in them and renewing them from within (On the Permanent Validity of the Church's Missionary Mandate, Chapter V).

This dialogue presupposes that the languages which this world religion encounters along its paths of spread are unhindered in any way, but often are assisted in their development. For example, the development of script for many African languages was under the impetus of the Christian missionaries who needed to make some of their documents accessible to the converts in their own language.

The languages in which the Christian message incarnated tended over time to form the language groups into homogeneous communities which didn't always see other homogeneous Christian communities as part of the same family. There were dire consequences in the past:

Churches formed the cultures to which they brought the message of Christ; they were also absorbed by those cultures. Ethnic wars were too often also religious wars, in which Christians fought against Christians. On the central European front Orthodox Russians fought Catholic Poles and, yes even then, Catholic Croats had it out with Orthodox Serbs, squeezing between them the heterodox Bosnians who later became Muslim. The Protestant Reformers set out to reform the One Holy Catholic Church and then found themselves, after exhausting wars, becoming the national religion of certain states (West 2009).

Where the national religions exist in the West, especially in Europe, they are associated with the national language. In the days of wars of religion in Europe citizens who belonged to other confessions than the one promoted by the State were persecuted and disenfranchised in different ways. They regained their civil rights gradually during the nineteenth century as the role of religion in society diminished with increasing secularization. As a result, the same national language serves the German Lutherans or Evangelicals and German Catholics, the British Anglicans and the British and Irish Catholics.

Secularism was part of the ideological baggage of the colonialists in Africa. Therefore, the national religions were not simply transplanted and recreated in the African colonies. The nineteenth century had begun to see religious affiliation not in terms of loyalty or disloyalty to the monarch – it is in fact a measure of secularization within religion itself that in time of war the Protestant English Crown could mobilize citizens, both Protestant and Catholic, against the mainly Catholic French. The concept of the nation and nationalism (Treanor 1997) had taken hold as values in defence of which the ultimate sacrifice could legitimately and honourably be made.

Conclusion

If West is right that churches formed and were subsequently absorbed by the cultures to which they brought the message of Christ, then they may have unwittingly facilitated and promoted the rise of nationalism which was to out-compete them in the enterprise of creating inclusive human communities across and beyond tribal and linguistic boundaries. It would appear to be the agenda of radical Islam today, including Boko Haram in Nigeria, to try and maintain Islam by preaching or by force – whichever serves – at the centre of consciousness and as the psychological content of identity in the Islamic world. Hence their rejection of democracy and longing for a single universal ruler for the whole of the Islamic world, with one and the same religious law governing every aspect of life. The changes, however, that followed from the wars described by West were profound and long-lasting - in every sense revolutionary. Henceforth the nation was to play the dominant role in shaping the sense of identity of the different peoples, a principle of which the learning has proved very difficult in most of the formerly colonised world, especially sub-Saharan Africa, where culture-forming ideologies at the scale of the modern state are still weakly developed. In the same movement out of which the nation state emerged, the old institutions, the monarchy and the Church, were swept away and their roles reduced. That nation state had clear markings: it had democratization and secularism as core values and *progress* for a governing ideology. Language and religion could serve as tools, but neither was any longer essential. Indeed the role of language in shaping individual thought processes, forming consciousness, and linking into a community the consciousnesses formed by the same means was de-emphasized and the communicative aspect became the dominant function.

Works Cited

- an-Nabhani, Taqiuddin. The Social System in Islam. London: Al-Khilafah Publications, 1990. PDF.
- Balkin, J. M. Cultural Software: A Theory of Ideology. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998. PDF.
- Benmamoun, Elabbas. 'Language Identities in Morocco in a Historical Context.' Ed Elmer H. Antonsen Studies in the Linguistic Sciences Volume 31, Number 1 (Spring 2001) 95-106. Web. 16 Jul. 2010.
- Clingerman, Forrest. 'Seeking the Depth of Nature in a Scientific World.' Technology, Trust, and Religion: Roles of Religions in Controversies on Ecology and the Modification of Life. Ed. Willem B. Drees. Leiden: University of Leiden, 2009. 141-58. Web. 22 Jul. 2010.
- Encyclopædia Britannica 2009 Ultimate Reference Suite. [DVD] Chicago: Encyclopædia Britannica, 2009.
- Farr, Thomas. 'Proselytism and Religious Identity Theft: Faith and Foreign Policy.' The Washington Post.26 Feb. 2010. Web.
- Habermas, Jürgen. Knowledge and Human Interests. Boston: Beacon Press, 1971.PDF.
- ____. The Inclusion of the Other. Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1998. PDF.
- ____. 'The Second Destruction of Reason.' Trans. Brad Cox. 07 Mar. 2004. Web. 12 Apr. 2009.
- James, William. The Varieties of Religious Experience: A Study in Human Nature. The
- Pennsylvania State University, Electronic Classics Series. 2002. Web. 30 Mar. 2006.
- John Paul II. On the Permanent Validity of the Church's Missionary Mandate. Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 1990. Web.
- Lang, Andrew. Myth, Ritual, and Religion. 2001. Web.
- Lévi-Strauss, Claude. Structural Anthropology. New York: Basic Books, 1963. PDF.
- Lierman, John. The New Testament Moses: Christian Perceptions of Moses and Israel in the Setting of Jewish Religion. Tübingen, Germany: M.hr Siebeck, 2004. PDF.
- Macaulay, Thomas Babbington. History of England from the Accession of James the Second. Vol.IV. The Pennsylvania State University, Electronic Classics Series. 2006. Web.
- McLead, George F. 'Preface' in Burhanettin Tatar. Interpretation and the Problem of the Intention of the Author: Gadamer vs Hirsch. 01 April 2009. Web.18 July 2010.
- Microsoft® Encarta® 2009 [DVD]. Redmond, Washington: Microsoft Corporation, 2008.
- Nze, Chukwuemeka. 'The Influence of Christian Values on Culture.' 17 March 2009. Web. 17 July 2010.

- Okere, Theophilus. 'African Culture: the Past and the Present as an Indivisible Whole.' 17 March 2009. Web. 17 July 2010.
- Peachey, Paul.' A Socio-Political Analysis of Religious Enculturation.' 01 April 2009. Web. 19 July 2009.
- Robertson, Archibald. The Origins of Christianity, International Publishers, 1954-1962. Web.
- Rodano, John A. Ut Unum Sint: John Paul II's Ecumenical Commitment. The New Catholic Encyclopedia: Jubilee Volume, The Wojtyła Years. The Catholic University of America, 2001. Pp. 71-109. PDF.
- St Augustine. The City of God. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Christian Classics Ethereal Library. 1890. Web. 21 Jul. 2010.
- Strang, Barbara M.H. A History of English. London: Methuen, 1970. Print.
- The Jerusalem Bible. London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1985. BibleWorks, v.7 [DVD] 2006.
- Treanor, Paul. 'Structures of Nationalism.' 1997. Web. 23 Sep. 2005.
- Walsh, Leo. 'Proselytism and Evangelization: Important Distinctions for Catholic Catechists.' Catechetical Sunday. 16 September 2012. Web.
- West, Charles C. 'The Vocation of Christianity in a Conflictual World.' 01 April 2009. Web. 19 July 2009.